Package 'bootcluster'

December 12, 2025

Type Package

```
Title Bootstrapping Estimates of Clustering Stability
Version 0.4.3
Description Implementation of the bootstrapping approach for the estimation of clustering stabil-
      ity and its application in estimating the number of clusters, as intro-
      duced by Yu et al (2016)<a href="doi:10.1142/9789814749411_0007">doi:10.1142/9789814749411_0007</a>. Implementation of the non-
      parametric bootstrap approach to assessing the stability of module detection in a graph, the ex-
      tension for the selection of a parameter set that defines a graph from data in a way that opti-
      mizes stability and the corresponding visualization functions, as intro-
      duced by Tian et al (2021) < doi:10.1002/sam.11495>. Implemented out-of-bag stability estima-
      tion function and k-select Smin-based k-selection function as intro-
      duced by Liu et al (2022) <doi:10.1002/sam.11593>. Implemented ensemble cluster-
      ing method based-on k-means clustering method, spectral clustering method and hierarchi-
      cal clustering method.
Depends R (>= 3.5.1)
Imports cluster, mclust (>= 5.0.0), flexclust, fpc, dplyr, doParallel,
      foreach, igraph (>= 1.2.0), compiler, stats, parallel, grid,
      grDevices, ggplot2, gridExtra, intergraph, GGally, network,
      kernlab, sna, progress
License GPL-2
Encoding UTF-8
LazyData true
RoxygenNote 7.3.2
NeedsCompilation no
Author Han Yu [aut],
      Mingmei Tian [aut],
      Tianmou Liu [aut, cre] (ORCID: <a href="https://orcid.org/0000-0003-3584-0483">https://orcid.org/0000-0003-3584-0483</a>)
Maintainer Tianmou Liu <tianmouliu@outlook.com>
Repository CRAN
Date/Publication 2025-12-12 12:00:02 UTC
```

2 agreement

Contents

Index		2
Tanal and		•
	wine	22
	threshold.select	2
	stability	20
	ref_dist_pca	19
	ref_dist_bin	19
	ref_dist	18
	plot_moc_results	
	plot_moc_grid	16
	ob.stability	
	network.stability.output	
	network.stability	
	min_agreement	
	load_moc_datasets	
	k.select_ref	
	k.select	
	esmbl.stability	
	ensemble_cluster_multi_combinations	
	ensemble.cluster.multi	
	compare_moc_results	
	analyze_moc_datasets	
	agreement_nk	3
	agreement	2

Description

Calculate agreement between two clustering results

Usage

```
agreement(clst1, clst2)
```

Arguments

clst1 First clustering result
clst2 Second clustering result

Value

Vector of agreement values

agreement_nk 3

agreement_nk Calculate agreement between two clustering results with known nu ber of clusters	um-
---	-----

Description

Calculate agreement between two clustering results with known number of clusters

Usage

```
agreement_nk(clst1, clst2, nk)
```

Arguments

clst1 First clustering result
clst2 Second clustering result
nk Number of clusters

Value

Vector of agreement values

```
analyze_moc_datasets \it Multi-Method\ Ensemble\ Clustering\ Analysis\ for\ Multiple-Objective\ Clustering\ (MOC)\ Datasets
```

Description

Performs ensemble clustering analysis on multiple datasets using different clustering methods and compares their performance.

Usage

```
analyze_moc_datasets(
  datasets,
  selected,
  n_ref = 3,
  B = 100,
  plot = TRUE,
  plot_file = NULL
)
```

Arguments

datasets List of datasets to analyze selected Indices of datasets to analyze

n_ref Number of reference distributions (default: 3)

B Number of bootstrap samples (default: 100)

plot Whether to generate plots (default: TRUE)

plot_file Output file for plots (default: NULL)

Value

A list containing:

results Results for each dataset

ari_table Adjusted Rand Index comparison table

runtime_table Runtime comparison table

plots List of generated plots if plot=TRUE

compare_moc_results

Compare MOC Results

Description

Compare MOC Results

Usage

```
compare_moc_results(results, metric = "ari", plot = TRUE)
```

Arguments

results Results from analyze_moc_datasets

metric Metric to compare ("ari", "runtime", or "modularity")
plot Whether to generate comparison plot (default: TRUE)

ensemble.cluster.multi 5

```
ensemble.cluster.multi
```

Multi-Method Ensemble Clustering with Graph-based Consensus

Description

Implements ensemble clustering by combining multiple clustering methods (k-means, hierarchical, and spectral clustering) using a graph-based consensus approach.

Usage

```
ensemble.cluster.multi(
    x,
    k_km,
    k_hc,
    k_sc,
    n_ref = 3,
    B = 100,
    hc.method = "ward.D",
    dist_method = "euclidean"
)
```

Arguments

X	data.frame or matrix where rows are observations and columns are features
k_km	number of clusters for k-means clustering
k_hc	number of clusters for hierarchical clustering
k_sc	number of clusters for spectral clustering
n_ref	number of reference distributions for stability assessment (default: 3)
В	number of bootstrap samples for stability estimation (default: 100)
hc.method	hierarchical clustering method (default: "ward.D")
dist_method	distance method for spectral clustering (default: "euclidean")

Details

This function implements a multi-method ensemble clustering approach that: 1. Applies multiple clustering methods (k-means, hierarchical, spectral) 2. Assesses stability of each clustering through bootstrapping 3. Constructs a weighted bipartite graph representing all clusterings 4. Uses fast greedy community detection for final consensus

Value

A list containing:

membership Final cluster assignments from ensemble consensus

k_consensus Number of clusters found in consensus
individual_results List of results from individual clustering methods
stability_measures Stability measures for each method
graph igraph object of the ensemble graph

Examples

```
data(iris)
df <- iris[,1:4]
result <- ensemble.cluster.multi(df, k_km=3, k_hc=3, k_sc=3)
plot(df[,1:2], col=result$membership, pch=16)</pre>
```

```
{\it multi-Method\ Ensemble\ Clustering\ with\ Multiple\ Stability\ Combinations}
```

Description

Implements ensemble clustering using multiple methods for combining stability measures, generating separate consensus results for each combination method.

Usage

```
ensemble_cluster_multi_combinations(
    x,
    k_km,
    k_hc,
    k_sc,
    n_ref = 3,
    B = 100,
    hc.method = "ward.D",
    dist_method = "euclidean",
    alpha = 0.25
)
```

Arguments

X	data.frame or matrix where rows are observations and columns are features
k_km	number of clusters for k-means clustering
k_hc	number of clusters for hierarchical clustering
k_sc	number of clusters for spectral clustering
n_ref	number of reference distributions for stability assessment (default: 3)

B number of bootstrap samples for stability estimation (default: 100)

hc.method hierarchical clustering method (default: "ward.D")

dist_method distance method for spectral clustering (default: "euclidean")

alpha weight for weighted combination (default: 0.5)

Value

A list containing results for each combination method:

product Results using product combination
 arithmetic Results using arithmetic mean
 geometric Results using geometric mean
 harmonic Results using harmonic mean
 weighted Results using weighted combination

Each method's results contain:

fastgreedy Results from fast greedy community detection

metis Results from METIS (leading eigenvector) community detection

hmetis Results from hMETIS (Louvain) community detection

graph igraph object of the ensemble graph

edge_weights Edge weights of the graph

individual_results Results from individual clustering methods

stability measures Stability measures

incidence_matrix Incidence matrix used for graph construction

Each community detection method's results contain:

membership Final cluster assignments

k_consensus Number of clusters found

The function also returns comparison statistics for each community detection method:

comparison\$fastgreedy Comparison stats for fast greedy results
comparison\$metis Comparison stats for METIS results
comparison\$hmetis Comparison stats for hMETIS results

Examples

8 esmbl.stability

esmbl.stability	Estimate the stability of a clustering based on non-parametric boot-
·	strap out-of-bag scheme, with option for subsampling scheme

Description

Estimate the stability of a clustering based on non-parametric bootstrap out-of-bag scheme, with option for subsampling scheme

Usage

```
esmbl.stability(
    X,
    k,
    scheme = "kmeans",
    B = 100,
    hc.method = "ward.D",
    cut_ratio = 0.5,
    dist_method = "euclidean"
)
```

Arguments

х	$\mbox{\tt data.frame}$ of the data set where rows are observations and columns are features
k	number of clusters for which to estimate the stability
scheme	clustering method to use ("kmeans", "hc", or "spectral")
В	number of bootstrap re-samples
hc.method	hierarchical clustering method (default: "ward.D")
cut_ratio	ratio for subsampling (default: 0.5)
dist_method	distance method for spectral clustering (default: "euclidean")

Details

This function estimates the stability through out-of-bag observations It estimate the stability at the (1) observation level, (2) cluster level, and (3) overall.

Value

```
membership vector of membership for each observation from the reference clustering
obs_wise vector of estimated observation-wise stability
clust_wise vector of estimated cluster-wise stability
overall numeric estimated overall stability
Smin numeric estimated Smin through out-of-bag scheme
```

k.select 9

Author(s)

Tianmou Liu

Examples

```
set.seed(123)
data(iris)
df <- iris[,1:4]
result <- esmbl.stability(df, k=3, scheme="kmeans")</pre>
```

k.select

Estimate number of clusters

Description

Estimate number of clusters by bootstrapping stability

Usage

```
k.select(x, range = 2:7, B = 20, r = 5, threshold = 0.8, scheme_2 = TRUE)
```

Arguments

x a data.frame of the data set

range a vector of integer values, of the possible numbers of clusters k

B number of bootstrap re-samplings

r number of runs of k-means threshold the threshold for determining k

scheme_2 logical TRUE if scheme 2 is used, FASLE if scheme 1 is used

Details

This function estimates the number of clusters through a bootstrapping approach, and a measure Smin, which is based on an observation-wise similarity among clusterings. The number of clusters k is selected as the largest number of clusters, for which the Smin is greater than a threshold. The threshold is often selected between $0.8 \sim 0.9$. Two schemes are provided. Scheme 1 uses the clustering of the original data as the reference for stability calculations. Scheme 2 searches acrossthe clustering samples that gives the most stable clustering.

Value

```
profile a vector of Smin measures for determining k
k integer estimated number of clusters
```

10 k.select_ref

Author(s)

Han Yu

References

Bootstrapping estimates of stability for clusters, observations and model selection. Han Yu, Brian Chapman, Arianna DiFlorio, Ellen Eischen, David Gotz, Matthews Jacob and Rachael Hageman Blair.

Examples

```
set.seed(1)
data(wine)
x0 <- wine[,2:14]
x <- scale(x0)
k.select(x, range = 2:10, B=20, r=5, scheme_2 = TRUE)</pre>
```

k.select_ref

Estimate number of clusters

Description

Estimate number of clusters by bootstrapping stability

Usage

```
k.select_ref(df, k_range = 2:7, n_ref = 5, B = 100, B_ref = 50, r = 5)
```

Arguments

df data.frame of the input dataset

k_range integer valued vector of the numbers of clusters k to be tested upon

n_ref number of reference distribution to be generated

B number of bootstrap re-samples

B_ref number of bootstrap resamples for the reference distributions

r number of runs of k-means

Details

This function uses the out-of-bag scheme to estimate the number of clusters in a dataset. The function calculate the Smin of the dataset and at the same time, generate a reference dataset with the same range as the original dataset in each dimension and calculate the Smin_ref. The differences between Smin and Smin_ref at each k,Smin_diff(k), is taken into consideration as well as the standard deviation of the differences. We choose the k to be the argmax of (Smin_diff(k) - (Smin_diff(k+1) + (Smin_diff(k+1)))). If Smin_diff(k) less than 0.1 for all k in k_range, we say k=1

load_moc_datasets 11

Value

```
\label{eq:condition} profile \ vector \ of \ ( \ Smin\_diff(k) - ( \ Smin\_diff(k+1) + se(Smin\_diff(k+1)) \ ) \ ) \ measures \ for \ researchers's \ inspection
```

k estimated number of clusters

Author(s)

Tianmou Liu

References

Bootstrapping estimates of stability for clusters, observations and model selection. Han Yu, Brian Chapman, Arianna DiFlorio, Ellen Eischen, David Gotz, Matthews Jacob and Rachael Hageman Blair.

Examples

```
set.seed(1)
data(iris)
df <- data.frame(iris[,1:4])
df <- scale(df)
k.select_ref(df, k_range = 2:7, n_ref = 5, B=500, B_ref = 500, r=5)</pre>
```

load_moc_datasets

Load Multiple-Objective Clustering (MOC) Datasets

Description

Loads and processes datasets for multiple-objective clustering analysis. The function loads CSV files from a specified directory and processes them by removing NA columns.

Usage

```
load_moc_datasets(data_dir = getwd())
```

Arguments

data_dir

Directory containing the CSV datasets (default: current working directory)

Value

A list containing:

datasets Named list of processed datasets

12 network.stability

Examples

```
## Not run:
# Load datasets
result <- load_moc_datasets("path/to/MOC_Data")
# Access a specific dataset
spiral <- result$datasets$Spiral
## End(Not run)</pre>
```

min_agreement

Calculate minimum agreement across clusters

Description

Calculates the minimum average agreement value across all clusters

Usage

```
min_agreement(clst, agrmt)
```

Arguments

clst clustering result vector agrmt agreement values vector

Value

minimum average agreement value across clusters

network.stability

Estimate of detect module stability

Description

Estimate of detect module stability

Usage

```
network.stability(
  data.input,
  threshold,
  B = 20,
  cor.method,
  large.size,
  PermuNo,
  scheme_2 = FALSE
)
```

network.stability 13

Arguments

data.input	a data. frame of the data set where the rows are observations and columns are covariates
threshold	a numeric number of threshold for correlation matrix
В	number of bootstrap re-samplings
cor.method	the correlation method applied to the data set, three method are available: "pearson", "kendall", "spearman".
large.size	the smallest set of modules, the large.size=0 is recommended to use right now.
PermuNo	number of random graphs for null
scheme_2	logical TRUE if scheme 2 is used, FASLE if scheme 1 is used. Right now, only

Details

This function estimates the modules' stability through bootstrapping approach for the given threshold. The approach to stability estimation is to compare the module composition of the reference correlation graph to the various bootstrapped correlation graphs, and to assess the stability at the (1) node-level, (2) module-level, and (3) overall.

FASLE is recommended.

Value

```
stabilityresult a list of result for nodes-wise stability

modularityresult list of modularity information with the given threshold

jaccardresult list estimated unconditional observed stability and the estimates of expected stability under the null

originalinformation list information for original data, igraph object and adjacency matrix constructed with the given threshold
```

Author(s)

Mingmei Tian

References

A framework for stability-based module detection in correlation graphs. Mingmei Tian,Rachael Hageman Blair,Lina Mu, Matthew Bonner, Richard Browne and Han Yu.

Examples

```
set.seed(1)
data(wine)
x0 <- wine[1:50,]

mytest<-network.stability(data.input=x0,threshold=0.7, B=20,
cor.method='pearson',large.size=0,
PermuNo = 10,</pre>
```

```
scheme_2 = FALSE)
```

network.stability.output

Plot method for objests from threshold.select

Description

Plot method for objests from threshold.select

Usage

```
network.stability.output(input, optimal.only = FALSE)
```

Arguments

input a list of results from function threshold.select

optimal.only a logical value indicating whether only plot the network with optimal threshold

or not. The default is False, generating all network figures with a large number

of nodes could take some time.

Details

network.stability.output is used to generate a series of network plots based on the given threshold.seq,where the nodes are colored by the level of stability. The network with optimal threshold value selected by function threshold.select is colored as red.

Value

Plot of network figures

Author(s)

Mingmei Tian

References

A framework for stability-based module detection in correlation graphs. Mingmei Tian,Rachael Hageman Blair,Lina Mu, Matthew Bonner, Richard Browne and Han Yu.

ob.stability 15

Examples

```
set.seed(1)
data(wine)
x0 <- wine[1:50,]

mytest<-threshold.select(data.input=x0,threshold.seq=seq(0.1,0.5,by=0.05), B=20,
cor.method='pearson',large.size=0,
PermuNo = 10,
no_cores=1,
scheme_2 = FALSE)
network.stability.output(mytest)</pre>
```

ob.stability

Estimate the stability of a clustering based on non-parametric bootstrap out-of-bag scheme, with option for subsampling scheme

Description

Estimate the stability of a clustering based on non-parametric bootstrap out-of-bag scheme, with option for subsampling scheme

Usage

```
ob.stability(x, k, B = 500, r = 5, subsample = FALSE, cut_ratio = 0.5)
```

Arguments

X	data.frame of the data set where the rows as observations and columns as dimensions of features
k	number of clusters for which to estimate the stability
В	number of bootstrap re-samples
r	integer parameter in the kmeansCBI() funtion
subsample	logical parameter to use the subsampling scheme option in the resampling process (instead of bootstrap)
cut_ratio	numeric parameter between 0 and 1 for subsampling scheme training set ratio

Details

This function estimates the stability through out-of-bag observations It estimate the stability at the (1) observation level, (2) cluster level, and (3) overall.

plot_moc_grid

Value

```
membership vector of membership for each observation from the reference clustering obs_wise vector of estimated observation-wise stability clust_wise vector of estimated cluster-wise stability overall numeric estimated overall stability

Smin numeric estimated Smin through out-of-bag scheme
```

Author(s)

Tianmou Liu

References

Bootstrapping estimates of stability for clusters, observations and model selection. Han Yu, Brian Chapman, Arianna DiFlorio, Ellen Eischen, David Gotz, Matthews Jacob and Rachael Hageman Blair.

Examples

```
set.seed(123)
data(iris)
df <- data.frame(iris[,1:4])
# You can choose to scale df before clustering by
# df <- scale(df)
ob.stability(df, k = 2, B=500, r=5)</pre>
```

plot_moc_grid

Create a Grid Plot of MOC Results

Description

Creates a grid plot with datasets as rows and clustering methods as columns. This function is designed to visualize multiple datasets and methods in a single plot.

Usage

```
plot_moc_grid(
   results,
   dataset_names = NULL,
methods = c("kmeans", "hierarchical", "spectral", "fastgreedy", "metis", "hmetis"),
   plot_file = NULL,
   format = "pdf",
   mar = c(2, 2, 2, 1),
   cex = 0.7,
```

plot_moc_results 17

```
point_size = 0.8,
  family = "serif",
  label_style = TRUE,
  maintain_aspect_ratio = TRUE)
```

Arguments

results Results from analyze_moc_datasets

dataset_names Names of datasets to plot (default: all datasets in results)

methods Methods to plot (default: all available methods)

plot_file Output file for plots (default: NULL)

format Output format, either "pdf" or "eps" (default: "pdf")

mar Margins for plots (default: c(2, 2, 2, 1))

cex Text size multiplier (default: 0.7)

point_size Point size for scatter plots (default: 0.8)

family Font family (default: "serif" for Times New Roman)
label_style Whether to add row/column labels (default: TRUE)

maintain_aspect_ratio

Whether to maintain aspect ratio in PDF (default: TRUE)

Value

Invisibly returns the layout information

Description

Plot MOC Results

Usage

```
plot_moc_results(
    results,
    dataset_names,
    methods = c("kmeans", "hierarchical", "spectral", "fastgreedy", "metis", "hmetis"),
    plot_file = NULL,
    max_plots_per_page = 12,
    mar = c(2, 2, 2, 1)
)
```

ref_dist

Arguments

results Results from analyze_moc_datasets

methods Methods to plot (default: c("fastgreedy", "metis", "hmetis"))

plot_file Output file for plots (default: NULL)

max_plots_per_page

Maximum number of plots per page (default: 12)

mar Margins for plots (default: c(2, 2, 2, 1))

ref_dist

Generate reference distribution for stability assessment

Description

Generates a reference distribution by sampling from uniform distributions with ranges determined by the original data.

Usage

```
ref_dist(df)
```

Arguments

df

data.frame or matrix of the original dataset

Details

Generate Reference Distribution

Value

A scaled matrix containing the reference distribution

Examples

```
data(iris)
df <- iris[,1:4]
ref <- ref_dist(df)</pre>
```

ref_dist_bin

ref_dist_bin

Generate reference distribution for binary data

Description

Generates a reference distribution by randomly permuting each column of the original binary dataset.

Usage

```
ref_dist_bin(df)
```

Arguments

df

data.frame or matrix of the original binary dataset

Details

Generate Binary Reference Distribution

Value

A matrix containing the permuted binary reference distribution

Examples

```
binary_data <- matrix(sample(0:1, 100, replace=TRUE), ncol=5)
ref <- ref_dist_bin(binary_data)</pre>
```

ref_dist_pca

Generate PCA-based reference distribution

Description

Generates a reference distribution in PCA space by sampling from uniform distributions with ranges determined by the PCA-transformed data.

Usage

```
ref_dist_pca(df)
```

Arguments

df

data.frame or matrix of the original dataset

20 stability

Details

Generate Reference Distribution using PCA

Value

A scaled matrix containing the reference distribution in PCA space

Examples

```
data(iris)
df <- iris[,1:4]
ref <- ref_dist_pca(df)</pre>
```

stability

Estimate clustering stability of k-means

Description

Estimate of k-means bootstrapping stability

Usage

```
stability(x, k, B = 20, r = 5, scheme_2 = TRUE)
```

Arguments

x	a data.frame of the data set
k	a integer number of clusters
В	number of bootstrap re-samplings
r	number of runs of k-means
scheme_2	logical TRUE if scheme 2 is used, FASLE if scheme 1 is used

Details

This function estimates the clustering stability through bootstrapping approach. Two schemes are provided. Scheme 1 uses the clustering of the original data as the reference for stability calculations. Scheme 2 searches acrossthe clustering samples that gives the most stable clustering.

Value

```
membership a vector of membership for each observation from the reference clustering obs_wise vector of estimated observation-wise stability overall numeric estimated overall stability
```

threshold.select 21

Author(s)

Han Yu

References

Bootstrapping estimates of stability for clusters, observations and model selection. Han Yu, Brian Chapman, Arianna DiFlorio, Ellen Eischen, David Gotz, Matthews Jacob and Rachael Hageman Blair.

Examples

```
set.seed(1)
data(wine)
x0 <- wine[,2:14]
x <- scale(x0)
stability(x, k = 3, B=20, r=5, scheme_2 = TRUE)</pre>
```

threshold.select

Estimate of the overall Jaccard stability

Description

Estimate of the overall Jaccard stability

be used yet).

Arguments

data.input	a data.frame of the data set where the rows are observations and columns are covariates
threshold.seq	a numeric sequence of candidate threshold
В	number of bootstrap re-samplings
cor.method	the correlation method applied to the data set, three method are available: "pearson", "kendall", "spearman".
large.size	the smallest set of modules, the large.size=0 is recommended to use right now.
PermuNo	number of random graphs for the estimation of expected stability
no_cores	a interger number of CPU cores on the current host (This function can't not

Details

threshold.select is used to estimate of the overall Jaccard stability from a sequence of given threshold candidates, threshold.seq.

22 wine

Value

```
stabilityresult a list of result for nodes-wise stability
```

modularityresult a list of modularity information with each candidate threshold

jaccardresult a list estimated unconditional observed stability and the estimates of expected stability under the nul

originalinformation a list information for original data, igraph object and adjacency matrix constructed with each candidate threshold

threshold.seq a list of candicate threshold given to the function

Author(s)

Mingmei Tian

References

A framework for stability-based module detection in correlation graphs. Mingmei Tian,Rachael Hageman Blair,Lina Mu, Matthew Bonner, Richard Browne and Han Yu.

Examples

```
set.seed(1)
data(wine)
x0 <- wine[1:50,]

mytest<-threshold.select(data.input=x0,threshold.seq=seq(0.5,0.8,by=0.05), B=20,
cor.method='pearson',large.size=0,
PermuNo = 10,
no_cores=1,
scheme_2 = FALSE)</pre>
```

wine

Wine Data Set

Description

These data are the results of a chemical analysis of wines grown in the same region in Italy but derived from three different cultivars. The analysis determined the quantities of 13 constituents found in each of the three types of wines.

Usage

```
data(wine)
```

Format

The data set wine contains a data.frame of 14 variables. The first variable is the types of wines. The other 13 variables are quantities of the constituents.

wine 23

References

https://archive.ics.uci.edu/ml/datasets/wine

Index

```
agreement, 2
agreement_nk, 3
\verb"analyze_moc_datasets", 3
compare_moc_results, 4
\verb|ensemble.cluster.multi|, 5
ensemble\_cluster\_multi\_combinations, \\ 6
esmbl.stability, 8
k.select, 9
k.select_ref, 10
load_moc_datasets, 11
min_agreement, 12
network.stability, 12
{\tt network.stability.output}, \\ 14
\verb"ob.stability", \textcolor{red}{15}
\verb"plot_moc_grid", 16"
\verb|plot_moc_results|, 17
ref_dist, 18
\texttt{ref\_dist\_bin}, \textcolor{red}{19}
ref_dist_pca, 19
stability, 20
threshold.\,select,\,\textcolor{red}{21}
wine, 22
```